

Energy average formula of photon gas rederived by using the generalized Hermann-Feynman theorem

Hong-yi Fan

Department of Physics, Shanghai Jiao Tong University, Shanghai, 200030, Chin

By virtue of the generalized Hermann-Feynman theorem and the method of characteristics we rederive energy average formula of photon gas, this is another useful application of the theorem.

PACS: 03.65.Ca

key words: generalized Hermann-Feynman theorem, Energy average formula

I. INTRODUCTION

It is common knowledge in the black-body radiation that the expectation value of a Planck oscillator of frequency ϖ_s is (excluding the zero-point energy term) is

$$\bar{E}_s = \frac{\hbar\varpi_s}{e^{\beta\hbar\varpi_s} - 1} \quad (1)$$

Historically, Planck derived this result in 1900 first by using thermodynamics and then by classical statistics. Later in 1924 Bose studied question such as the "probability of an energy level $E_s (= \hbar\varpi_s)$ being occupied by n_s photons at a time", he found the mean value of n_s is $\frac{1}{e^{\beta\hbar\varpi_s} - 1}$. Einstein, after reading Bose's paper, concluded that the basic fact to remember during the process of distributing the various photons over the various energy levels is that the photons are indistinguishable—a fact that had been implicitly taken care of in Bose's treatment (he essentially treated the light quanta as particles of a gas). Planck and Bose-Einstein obtain the same mean photon number and mean energy formulas with different approaches. We then ask: is there any other method with which we can rederive this formula? If yes, then this method is worth paying attention in quantum statistics. The purpose of this work is to re-derive the energy average formula of photon gas by using the generalized Hermann-Feynman theorem, a theorem regarding to the ensemble average of mixed states.

In quantum mechanics the usual Hermann-Feynman theorem [1, 2] is for pure states, which states that

$$\frac{\partial E_j(\chi)}{\partial \chi} = \langle j | \frac{\partial H(\chi)}{\partial \chi} | j \rangle, \quad \langle j | j \rangle = 1, \quad (2)$$

where H is the Hamiltonian depending on the parameter χ , and E_j and $|j\rangle$ are energy eigenvalues and eigenvectors of H , respectively. This theorem has been widely used in molecular physics, quantum chemistry and quantum statistics. Having noticed that Eq.(1) is just for pure state expectation value, we need a generalized Hellmann-Feynman theorem for mixed state in the sense of ensemble average in quantum statistics. In Ref.[3] the generalized Hellmann-Feynman theorem (GHFT) has been set up

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial \chi} \langle H \rangle_e = \left\langle [1 + \beta \langle H \rangle_e - \beta H] \frac{\partial H}{\partial \chi} \right\rangle_e, \quad (3)$$

where the subscript e stands for the ensemble average, $\beta = (kT)^{-1}$, k is the Boltzmann constant, and $\langle A \rangle_e \equiv \text{Tr}(e^{-\beta H} A) / \text{Tr}(e^{-\beta H})$ for arbitrary operator A . When H is β independent, $\frac{\partial H}{\partial \beta} = 0$, Eq.(3) can be reformed as

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial \chi} \langle H \rangle_e = \frac{\partial}{\partial \beta} \left[\beta \left\langle \frac{\partial H}{\partial \chi} \right\rangle_e \right]. \quad (4)$$

Now for the Bose oscillator Hamiltonian $H = \hbar\varpi a^\dagger a$, using (4) we see

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial}{\partial \varpi} \langle H \rangle_e &= \frac{\partial}{\partial \beta} \left[\beta \left\langle \frac{\partial H}{\partial \varpi} \right\rangle_e \right] = \frac{\partial}{\partial \beta} [\beta \langle \hbar a^\dagger a \rangle_e] \\ &= \frac{\partial}{\partial \varpi \partial \beta} [\beta \langle \hbar\varpi a^\dagger a \rangle_e] = \frac{\partial}{\partial \varpi \partial \beta} [\beta \langle H \rangle_e] \\ &= \frac{1}{\varpi} \langle H \rangle_e + \frac{\beta \partial}{\partial \varpi \partial \beta} [\langle H \rangle_e], \end{aligned} \quad (5)$$

that is

$$\left(\varpi \frac{\partial}{\partial \varpi} - \beta \frac{\partial}{\partial \beta} [\langle H \rangle_e] \right) \langle H \rangle_e = \langle H \rangle_e, \quad (6)$$

which can be solved by virtue of the method of characteristics [4], according to it we have the equation

$$\frac{d\varpi}{\varpi} = -\frac{d\beta}{\beta} = \frac{d\langle H \rangle_e}{\langle H \rangle_e}. \quad (7)$$

It then follows two integration constants

$$\ln \varpi = -\ln \beta + C_1, \quad \ln \langle H \rangle_e - \ln \varpi = C_2, \quad (8)$$

which tells us that $\langle H \rangle_e$ is of the form

$$\langle H \rangle_e = \varpi F(\beta\varpi) \quad (9)$$

the form of F is to be determined. Eq. (9) can be confirmed by noticing

$$\varpi \frac{\partial}{\partial \varpi} = \frac{\partial}{\partial \ln \varpi}, \quad \ln \varpi \equiv x, \quad \ln \beta \equiv y, \quad (10)$$

and rewriting (6) as

$$\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial x} - 1 \right) \langle H \rangle_e = \frac{\partial}{\partial y} [\langle H \rangle_e], \quad (11)$$

its solution is

$$\langle H \rangle_e = e^x g(x+y) = \varpi F(\beta\varpi). \quad (12)$$

In order to make sure of F 's concrete form, we introduce $a = \left(\sqrt{\frac{m\varpi}{\hbar}} X + i \frac{P}{\sqrt{m\varpi\hbar}} \right) / \sqrt{2}$, so up to a zero-point energy term,

$$H = \frac{P^2}{2m} + \frac{1}{2} m \varpi^2 X^2. \quad (13)$$

We see when $\varpi \rightarrow 0$, $H \rightarrow \frac{p^2}{2m}$ (free particle), Eq. (9) reduces to

$$\lim_{\varpi \rightarrow 0} \langle H \rangle_e = \lim_{\varpi \rightarrow 0} \varpi F(\beta\varpi), \quad (14)$$

so if $\lim_{\varpi \rightarrow 0} \varpi F(\beta\varpi)$ is finite,

$$\lim_{\varpi \rightarrow 0} F(\beta\varpi) \rightarrow \infty. \quad (15)$$

On the other hand, we recall the Bloch equation for the density matrix ρ of a free particle

$$-\frac{\partial \rho(p, \beta)}{\partial \beta} = \frac{p^2}{2m} \rho(p, \beta), \quad (16)$$

its normalized solution

$$\rho(p, \beta) = \sqrt{\frac{\beta}{2m\pi}} e^{-\beta p^2/(2m)}, \quad \text{Tr} \rho = 1. \quad (17)$$

so the energy average for $H_f = \frac{p^2}{2m}$ is

$$\begin{aligned} \langle H_f \rangle_e &\equiv \left\langle \frac{p^2}{2m} \right\rangle_e = \sqrt{\frac{\beta}{2m\pi}} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \frac{p^2}{2m} e^{-\beta p^2/(2m)} dp \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{\beta}{2m\pi}} \left(-\frac{\partial}{\partial \beta} \right) \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} e^{-\beta p^2/(2m)} dp \\ &= \frac{1}{2\beta} = \frac{KT}{2}. \end{aligned} \quad (18)$$

Combining (18) and (14) we see

$$\langle H_f \rangle_e = \lim_{\varpi \rightarrow 0} \langle H \rangle_e = \lim_{\varpi \rightarrow 0} \varpi F(\beta\varpi) = 0 \times \infty = \frac{1}{2\beta}. \quad (19)$$

Using the rule of searching for limitation,

$$\frac{1}{\beta} = \lim_{\varpi \rightarrow 0} \frac{\hbar}{\beta \hbar e^{\beta \hbar \varpi}} = \hbar \lim_{\varpi \rightarrow 0} \varpi \times \frac{1}{e^{\beta \hbar \varpi} - 1}, \quad (20)$$

comparing 20) with (19) and considering (15) we can determine the form of $F(\beta\varpi)$,

$$F(\beta\varpi) = \frac{1}{e^{\beta \hbar \varpi} - 1}, \quad (21)$$

so follows $\langle H \rangle_e = \frac{\hbar \varpi}{e^{\beta \hbar \varpi} - 1}$.

Besides, using the GHFT we can also provide:

1. average kinetic energy = average potential energy. To prove this, we notice

$$[XP, H] = i \frac{P^2}{m} - im\varpi^2 X^2, \quad (22)$$

due to

$$0 = \langle [XP, H] \rangle_e = i \left\langle \frac{P^2}{m} \right\rangle_e - i \langle m\varpi^2 X^2 \rangle_e \quad (23)$$

so

$$\begin{aligned} \langle H \rangle_e &= \left\langle \frac{p^2}{2m} + \frac{1}{2} m \varpi^2 x^2 \right\rangle_e \\ &= \left\langle \frac{p^2}{m} \right\rangle_e = \langle m\varpi^2 x^2 \rangle_e. \end{aligned} \quad (24)$$

2. Though H involves the mass, $\langle H \rangle_e$ is m independent. In fact, using (23) and (2) we have

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial}{\partial m} \langle H \rangle_e &= \frac{\partial}{\partial \beta} \left[\beta \left\langle \frac{\partial H}{\partial m} \right\rangle_e \right] \\ &= \frac{\partial}{\partial \beta} \left\langle \beta \left(\frac{\varpi^2}{2} x^2 - \frac{1}{2m^2} p^2 \right) \right\rangle_e = 0. \end{aligned} \quad (25)$$

In sum, we have rederived the energy average formula of photon gas (Bose distribution) by using the GHFT, this is another useful application of the theorem. The other application can be seen in Ref.[5].

-
- [1] H. Hellmann, Einführung in die Quantenchemie. (F. Deuticke, Leipzig, 1937)
[2] R. P. Feynmann, Phys. Rev. 56 (1939) 340
[3] Hong-yi Fan and Bo-zhan Chen, Phys. Lett. A 203 (1995) 95
[4] There is a concise introduction about the method of char-

- acteristics in the book: M. Orszag, Quantum Optics, Springer-Verlag, Berlin (2000)
[5] Hong-yi Fan and Zhong-hua Jiang, Commun. Theor. Phys. 44 (2005) 1041